

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS AT A MEETING OF THE
CORK EDUCATION AND TRAINING BOARD
COUNCIL CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL
17th OCTOBER 2013

ATTENDANCE

<i>Cllr. Tim Brosnan</i>	<i>Cllr. Noel O' Connor</i>
<i>Mr. Paddy Browne</i>	<i>Ms. Una O' Donnell</i>
<i>Cllr. Liam Burke</i>	<i>Cllr. Noel O' Donovan</i>
<i>Mr. Michael Carey</i>	<i>Cllr. Tadhg O' Donovan</i>
<i>Ms. Catherine Cashin</i>	<i>Cllr. Finbarr O' Driscoll</i>
<i>Ms. Josephine Coffey</i>	<i>Cllr. Patrick O' Driscoll</i>
<i>Cllr. Jim Corr</i>	<i>Cllr. Catherine O' Keeffe</i>
<i>Cllr. Humphrey Deegan</i>	<i>Cllr. Chris O' Leary</i>
<i>Rev. Dr. Tom Deenihan</i>	<i>Cllr. Aindrias ÓMuimhneachá in</i>
<i>Cllr. Connie Foley</i>	<i>Cllr. Niall O' Neill</i>
<i>Cllr. Ger Gibbons</i>	<i>Cllr. Donal O' Rourke</i>
<i>Cllr. Mary Hegarty</i>	<i>Mr. Sean Roberts</i>
<i>Cllr. Gerry Kelly</i>	<i>Ms. Má ire Roycroft</i>
<i>Ms. Helen McGrath</i>	<i>Rev. Canon Salter</i>
<i>Ms. Marie Murphy</i>	<i>Cllr. Terry Shannon</i>
<i>Ms. Norma Murray</i>	<i>Cllr. Ronan Sheehan</i>
<i>Cllr. Tomás O' Brien</i>	<i>Mr. Gerard White</i>
<i>Cllr. Michael O' Connell</i>	

EXECUTIVE & ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

<i>Mr. Ted Owens, CEO</i>	<i>Mr. Martin Hallahan, PO</i>
<i>Ms. Joan Russell, EO</i>	<i>Mr. John O' Regan, PO</i>
<i>Mr. John Fitzgibbons, EO</i>	<i>Ms. Clare Creedon (Minute Taker)</i>

WELCOME

The Chairman welcomed members to the Council Chamber and noted that some members were delayed at an Audit Committee meeting and would join the main meeting afterwards.

APOLOGIES

- Apologies for inability to attend the meeting were received from Board Members, Mr. Liam Ahern, Cllr. Noel Buckley and Cllr. Emmet O' Halloran.

CONDOLENCES

✠ To Mary Bulman, cleaner in Colá iste Choilm, and family, on the death of her brother Joseph

✠ To Deirdre Keogh, staff member in ETBI, on the death of her sister

The Chairman stated that it was tradition in County Cork VEC to say a prayer for the deceased and asked members if this was agreeable. A lengthy debate followed as to whether it was appropriate in 2013 for a public body to begin proceedings with a prayer.

Members expressed views in favour and against the proposal. Eventually a show of hands took place. The result of the vote was 13 members in favour of having a prayer at the beginning of ETB meetings and 8 members against having a prayer at the beginning of meetings.

CONGRATULATIONS

- To Rev. Dr. Tom Deenihan on his appointment as General Secretary of the Catholic Primary Schools Management Association
- To Christín Ní Dheasúna, student from Coláiste Ghobnatan, who won a silver medal in the 69kg category at the World Women's Youth and Junior Boxing Championships

MINUTES

The Board, on the proposition of Rev. Canon Salter, seconded by Cllr. Mary Hegarty, adopted the minutes of the previous ETB meeting held on **26th September 2013 (copy herewith)**.

CORRESPONDENCE

The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Chris O' Leary, seconded by Rev. Canon Salter, adopted the DoESk, ETBI and General Correspondence as presented (**copies herewith**).

General Correspondence

- **Letter dated 26.09.2013 – Briery Gap Cultural Centre** - Cllr. Aindrias Ó Muimhneachá in proposed this request for funding strongly. He stated that several thousand students take part in the events of the Briery Gap Centre. This was seconded by Cllr. Connie Foley. The CEO stated that this matter was for the Board to approve or not and will take their advice on the matter. It was agreed to support this request for funding.
- **Letter dated 14.10.2013 – Cork City Partnership Ltd** – The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Tadhg O' Donovan, seconded by Cllr. Jim Corr, approved the appointment of Mr. Denis Barrett, CEF, to the Board of Cork City Partnership Ltd.
- **Letter dated 26.04.2013 – CIT** – The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Mary Hegarty, seconded by Mr. Michael Carey, approved the appointment of Ms. Ciara O' Connor and Mr. Danny O' Donovan, as student nominees, to the Governing Body of CIT.

CEO' S REPORT

The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Ger Gibbons, seconded by Cllr. Terry Shannon, approved the adoption of the CEO' s Report, incorporating the Education Report, Finance Report, Human Resources Report and the Capital Report (**copies herewith**).

- **Item 4 – Haddington Road Agreement** – The CEO informed members that TUI have written to ETBs stating that it is the roll of ETBs to gather the information from teachers as there are data protection issues with them obtaining said information. CETB has written to all schools asking teachers to inform HR of what union they are affiliated to.
- **Item 5 – Regional Further and Higher Education Clusters** – The CEO stated that these meetings are in an effort to formalise the collaboration between further and higher education, in terms of progression from CETB colleges to CIT and UCC. He stated that it would be preferable to have formal agreements in place. He noted that many students who have completed courses in UCC have attended a PLC college afterwards for further experience.
- **Item 7 – Capital Projects**
 - **Davis College, Mallow** – The CEO advised that revised plans are necessary as the residents have concerns with regards road access and car parking.
 - **St. Johns College** – The CEO stated that the budget will now not cover the necessary works and that CETB will approach the DoESk to request further funding.
- **Item 8 – Board meetings and Prize Givings** – The CEO stated that tradition in the City VEC was that the CEO or John Fitzgibbons, EO, would attend all BOM meetings. He stated that considering the size of the scheme and the geographical spread of schools and centres now, this would be impossible.

Cllr. Patrick O’ Driscoll referred to item 3 regarding tutor posts and asked the CEO for information with regards to pay and terms and conditions. The CEO responded by stating that information has not been received to date regarding pay and terms and conditions but he believes that they will be paid at the unqualified teacher rate. Cllr. O’ Driscoll stated that once again, teachers in the ETB sector are being treated differently to teachers in other sectors. The CEO stated that CETB fought hard against the reclassification of posts.

Cllr. Catherine O’ Keeffe referred to the capital projects and asked the CEO if there was any update on Skibbereen. The CEO referred this query to Mr. Martin Hallahan. Mr. Hallahan stated that the project is being managed by the NDFA and their technical people were in Skibbereen last week to finalise certain aspects of the application regarding boundary and gates. He stated that he was ensured that they intend to submit the application within the next few weeks. He noted that he would hope progress would be made by the November ETB meeting but CETB has no control over this matter.

Cllr. Humphrey Deegan referred to planning for Clonakilty Community College and asked if there was an update on this. Mr. Hallahan stated that CETB is communicating with the DoESk in relation to this. A revised schedule of accommodation is being drawn up to take into account provision for children with special educational needs.

Education Report

Reports were provided from Mr. John Fitzgibbons, EO and Ms. Joan Russell, EO.

Mr. Sean Roberts referred to item 4 on Mr. John Fitzgibbons report regarding the implementation of the Haddington Road Agreement and asked if CIDs will be back dated to September when they are finally processed. The CEO stated that he expects they will.

Cllr. Chris O' Leary asked Mr. John Fitzgibbons for a figure regarding the number of students dropping out at PLC level as a result of not receiving the student grant, BTEI or VTOS. Mr. Fitzgibbons stated that he did not have an exact figure but that it would certainly be higher than 10%. Cllr. O' Leary stated that this is a huge concern going forward with regards to re-activation and trying to get individuals back to education.

COMMITTEES

Youth Committee

The CEO stated that traditionally there was a Youth Committee in the City VEC and the Youth Officers have stated that a Committee is needed. The CEO proposed to elect this Committee. This was agreed by all members. The following members were nominated to the Youth Committee:

1. Mr. Gerard White
2. Cllr. Tadhg O' Donovan
3. Cllr. Connie Foley
4. Cllr. Terry Shannon
5. Cllr. Chris O' Leary
6. Ms. Marie Murphy
7. Cllr. Noel O' Donovan

Other Committees

The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Terry Shannon, seconded by Rev. Canon Salter, approved the appointment of Mr. David Hegarty and Ms. Laura O' Donoghue as student nominees to the BOM of Cork College of Commerce.

Audit Committee

Cllr. Donal O' Rourke referred to the minutes of the previous Audit Committee meeting and stated that it was his understanding that the information from Audit Committee meetings would follow a particular route and he was surprised, once again, to see information appear on the Irish Examiner and felt an explanation was required. Cllr. Michael O' Connell, Chairman of the Audit Committee stated that he too was surprised to read the article in the Irish Examiner the morning after the Audit Committee meeting. He stated that the press were in attendance at the ETB meeting proper and asked to leave the meeting for its "in-Committee" session. After a discussion with the CEO, Cllr. O' Connell informed members that it transpired that the members of the press were taken to another room in the building and that sensitive documents relating to the Audit Committee meeting were in that room and this is where the journalist accessed the document. He noted that there was a subsequent article on the paper. He informed members that he called a special Audit Committee meeting before this ETB meeting proper and stated to members of the Audit Committee that he was of the belief that discussion would be confidential. He also stated that he is a member of CETB and his allegiance is to this Board. He stated that members have been asked to park discussions until the Section 7 report from the C&AG arrives and it is not helpful to have matters discussed in the public domain and he urged members, once again, to keep sensitive issues within the Board and the Audit Committee.

Cllr. Donal O' Rourke responded to Cllr. O' Connell by stating that it was suggested that documents were left in a room which means the Executive were careless with documents. If a journalist gained access to sensitive documents and subsequently used those documents to write a report, then he would see this as being completely unethical.

The CEO stated that any carelessness lies with him. He told members that the journalist was escorted to another area, inside a locked door. He stated that he believes the document was not leaked by any member of the Board. The CEO explained that he contacted the journalist and informed him that he believed that the manner in which he obtained the document was unethical. The CEO subsequently contacted the Editor and Assistant Editor of the Irish Examiner but neither has responded to date. The CEO stated that he echoed Cllr. Michael O' Connells sentiments and that loyalty and confidentiality are required of

ETB members. Mr. Gerard White stated that the Board must agree that all sensitive issues must be confidential.

Cllr. Niall O' Neill stated that he was a member of the previous County Audit Committee and he had a vain hope that matters would change when CETB was established. Issues were deferred until the Section 7 report from the C&AG is received and this agreement should be adhered to. He stated that members are today listening to the same stories and controversy is courting controversy. He proposed that the activities of the Audit Committee should be suspended until the Section 7 report is received. He stated that if meetings continue in this manner he will resign from the Board as it is demoralising and counterproductive to conduct business in this manner. Cllr. Michael O' Connell stated that there is no need to suspend the Audit Committee activities as the Committee will not meet again until the Section 7 report is received.

Cllr. Patrick O' Driscoll referred to the payments for referees and stated taxing these payments will affect matches in post primary schools. The CEO stated that the Revenue Commissioners have informed CETB that PAYE/PRSI must be deducted from these payments and that is what CETB will be doing. Cllr. O' Driscoll stated that he understands the CEO has to implement this but could the Board write to the Ministers for Finance, Sport and Children stating that deducting PAYE/PRSI will affect the availability of referees for matches. The CEO stated that CETB cannot make an issue out of this matter. Revenue Commissioners have given a directive. Cllr. Ger Gibbons stated that in his school they run 32 teams and queried if the staff are expected to record the matches played and fees paid. He noted that this will be a huge issue for schools. The CEO responded by stating that yes schools must record who refereed a match and how much it is proposed to pay the referee. He noted that CETB will arrange to put a system in place for this. Cllr. Niall O' Neill supported Cllr. O' Driscoll's sentiments and stated that the fee referees receive is not a large amount considering the work they undertake. Cllr. Humphrey Deegan agreed with the previous speakers and stated that the Ministers for Finance, Sport and Children may not be aware of this issue. The Chairman stated that the CEO cannot ignore the instructions of the Revenue Commissioners and that CETB has to conduct its business by the book. Mr. Michael Carey asked the CEO to ensure that the procedure CETB devises is workable and user friendly for staff that volunteer their time. The CEO stated that as a public body we need to be exemplar and it is not his role to make a case for referees.

Cllr. Donal O' Rourke referred to an article printed in a newspaper some time back where it stated that Cllr. Humphrey Deegan contacted Revenue regarding CCVEC and asked the CEO if this report was accurate or inaccurate. The CEO stated that Cllr. Deegan was quoted on the Irish Times on 29th October 2012. The CEO stated that when researching the issue, he found an e-mail from the Principal Officer on the 24th October 2012, informing the Finance Officer (in response to a query from her) that the issue should be referred to the Revenue Commissioners. He stated that these are the facts and the Executive of the time reported to the Revenue Commissioners. Cllr. O' Rourke asked the CEO when the report to Revenue was made and the CEO informed him it was made on the 31st October 2012.

Cllr. Humphrey Deegan stated that it would be advisable to ask Mr. Anthony Buckley, Assistant Secretary, Revenue Commissioners, to come to an ETB meeting and explain the matter to members. The CEO stated that Cllr. Deegan had suggested this at the first Audit Committee meeting of the ETB but that the Committee had not thought it necessary. The CEO stated that he has no issue with Revenue coming before any Committee but that it was the Committee or the Board to decide and not for him. He also stated that the Revenue Commissioners had officially recorded the declaration made to be a voluntary declaration. Cllr. Deegan remarked that this was only a technicality. The Chairman thanked the CEO for his clarification and stated that if Revenue state that CCVEC made a self-disclosure then he is happy with this. He stated that he would not sit as Chairman of the Board and endorse the work of the Executive if he was not entirely happy with it. He noted that Cllr. Michael O' Connell has made a fresh appeal for confidentiality and stated that he hopes members respect this. Cllr. Chris O' Leary queried if CETB will have a Whistleblowers Charter. The CEO stated that CETB will be required to have such a Charter in place and that he would welcome such a document.

MINUTES OF BOARDS AND COMMITTEES FOR RATIFICATION
--

The Board, on the proposition of Cllr. Terry Shannon, seconded by Rev. Canon Salter, approved the documents as outlined in the list submitted by the CEO (**copy herewith**).

AOB

Cllr. Donal O' Rourke questioned the CEO if the minutes of the meeting between the Secretary General, Cllr. Deegan and the CEO have been received. The CEO informed the meeting that he has not received the minutes to date. However, the CEO stated that Cllr. Deegan had informed him that the Secretary General had written stating that as he had not commented on a draft issued to him, that the minutes will be issued presently. Cllr. Deegan stated that there was a misunderstanding between himself and Mr. McCourt and that he has

responded to the Office of the Secretary General and the minutes will be issued presently. Cllr. Donal O' Rourke stated that he wants a copy of the minutes from the CEO when they arrive.

Mr. Michael Carey requested if a meeting with the Education Officers could be arranged to discuss urgent staffing issues in Coláiste Éist Linn. He also referred to a request that was sent in some months back to CCVEC from St. Fanahan's College regarding roof repairs and asked if one of the EOs could look into this matter.

Cllr. Humphrey Deegan asked the CEO for a report of what the DoESk accountant was reviewing in CCVEC and what the level of interaction with staff was. The Chairman stated that these issues should be raised through the appropriate forum of the Finance or Audit Committees. Cllr. Deegan stated that these queries have nothing to do with those Committees. He also asked the CEO for a report on how much CCVECs insurance has increased over the years and a report on how many claims have been settled over the years. The CEO responded by stating that he has no issue in giving this information to the Audit Committee. The request should be made, through the Chairman of the Audit Committee at the next meeting and if the Committee so desires, then the information will be made available.

Cllr. Chris O' Leary proposed that AOB should be taken off the agenda and that a discussion in relation to this should take place at the November meeting. This was agreed.

DATE & VENUE OF NEXT MEETING

The November meeting will take place on Thursday 21st November 2013 in the Council Chamber, County Hall.

THIS CONCLUDED THE BUSINESS OF THE MEETING

SIGNED: _____
Chairman

DATE: _____